**SABER seminar Q&A**

**Unanswered questions**

Anonymous Attendee 10:35 AM

The CAM training effects are very promising. I notice that the findings n = 26 but the total N = 70. Please comment. Also, how can we obtain CAM training in our departmens?

A: Yes, there were total 70 participants across 3 sites. Because these were pilot interventions used to refine the CAM training content, there were slight curricular modifications to sites 2 and 3. For that reason in the article, we report mentor skill gains within each site, not in aggregate (<https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC6191051/>). I shared data in my SABER talk from site 2, n=26 participants, because it was from a PWI sample with mentors of undergraduates and thus probably most similar to who might be in the SABER audience. The other 2 sites were from an HBCU and a statewide consortium of participants who were mentors and administrators.

Anonymous Attendee 10:46 AM

Are you investigating the experiences and perceptions of international scholars and students in mentoring relationships? Is there a global perspective to be acknowledged in this work?

A: Though there are international scholars and students in our study samples, I am not directly investigating unique perceptions of these populations in their mentoring relationships. Anecdotally, as a CAM facilitator I have personally observed international mentors in CAM trainings wrestle with understanding the US “brand” of racial/ethnic identity and diversity challenges, which influences how they engage in this topic with their mentees. This is an intriguing topic and I would welcome someone taking up this line of inquiry.

Janni Pedersen 10:47 AM

Will the slides be made available? There are a plethora of helpful links.

A: Yes.

Anonymous Attendee 10:47 AM

Not a mentor (yet), but I'm interested in how to be culturally sensitive towards different cultural perspective (especially of international students coming outside of an Euro-American context) that clash with other minorities' rights. E.g., I have assisted to a disregard of the use of preferred pronouns that has been justified as "cultural difference".

A: You may find useful resources on the NIH Diversity Program Consortium website to support your personal and professional development. <https://www.diversityprogramconsortium.org/pages/anti-racism_resources>

Quynh P. Nguyen (she, her) 10:47 AM

I’m wonderinng if you have looked at peer to peer mentoring or upperclassmen to new grad students mentoring. Are there different strategies for this sort of relationship? Thank you!

A: I have not examined peer to peer mentoring as my focus is predominantly on mentors. I direct you to the NASEM Science of Effective Mentorship report, chapter 4, where we review the literature on mentorship structures and address peer and near peer mentorship. Go to <https://www.nationalacademies.org/our-work/the-science-of-effective-mentoring-in-stemm>, scroll down, and click on “View Report.”

Ashley Juavinett (she/her/hers) 10:47 AM

Thank you for this wonderful talk! It’s really great to see mentor perceptions and confidence improve as they approach mentoring with cultural awareness. One thing I’m wondering is: is there evidence that students notice the difference?

A: Yes! We have results from a randomized control trial that we are submitting for journal review this month that documents that paired mentees of mentors who receive cultural awareness training notice the difference compared to mentees of mentors who do not receive this training. Details will be in that paper once published.

Tigress McDaniel 10:48 AM

I JUST WANT TO EXPRESS MY GRATITUDE FOR YOUR INDIVIDUAL AND COLLECTIVE WORK. CAPITALIZATION IS INTENDED FOR POSITIVE EMPHASIS

A: Thank you for your compliment and the gratitude!

Tianhong Shi 10:48 AM

could you show the recommended books slide again? And the website where your research/ training handout could be found?

A: Please see the slides.

Becca Price 10:48 AM

Thank you for your talk, Dr. Byars-Winston, as well as your entire research program. Do you think the CAM training can help faculty members learn a more culturally responsive approach to classroom teaching?

A: That is an interesting possibility, but we have not yet tested the impact of CAM on any professional practice but mentoring.

Kathryn Nicole Hosbein 10:48 AM

Absolutely loved your talk. Have your studies looked at power and the ability for mentors to learn from their mentees to change structures within graduate school that may be causing these racial or cultural tensions within their specific discipline?

A: I do not directly study the impact of mentees on mentors and subsequent influence on cultural changes in graduate training or disciplines. You might find these 2 articles of interest regarding the impact of mentees on mentors in STEM: Dodson et al., 2009. <https://link.springer.com/article/10.1007/s10755-009-9099-y>

Mondisa et al., 2021. <https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/full/10.1080/13611267.2021.1899588>

Anonymous Attendee 10:50 AM

How does a program get around the resistence of faculty participating because they feel it takes away from their scientific research?

A: In our NASEM Science of Effective Mentorship report, chapter 7, we address the topic of individual and institutional responsibility in advancing a culture of mentorship. We touch on several barriers to faculty participating in mentorship education in general, not just cultural diversity and mentoring. Go to <https://www.nationalacademies.org/our-work/the-science-of-effective-mentoring-in-stemm>, scroll down, and click on “View Report.” You might also find this article of interest <https://doi.org/10.1093/femspd/ftab038>

Huaxiao 'Adam' Yang 10:50 AM

Could you elaborate more how to start the conversation with the mentees about their potential racial concerns in the current academic environment? Especially the mentor and mentee are in the different races.

A: There are a number of resources on “conversation starters.” You may do well to visit Smithsonian’s National Museum of African American History and Culture

<https://nmaahc.si.edu/learn/talking-about-race/audiences/committed-equity>. Then click on a particular topic for more information. For e.g., click on “race and racial identity” and there are several pop out boxes and sections that may be useful to informing how you broach cultural diversity topics. Scroll down to the section “Let’s Act” and click on “activity” and there’s a PDF called “Living Room Conversations” with guiding topics and conversation starters.

Maria Solano-Solano 10:51 AM

If the mentor matching is good for certain period of time. When it is a good time to suggest the mentee to swicth to another mentor?

A: Having a sense of mentees’ needs in terms of what support they need to develop toward their goals will guide the answer to your question about switching mentors. Creating and using a Mentor Map is very helpful in gauging what mentees need and from whom they can best get the support/resource. Read Beronda Montgomery’s (2017) article: <https://journals.sagepub.com/doi/full/10.1177/2158244017710288>

Sandhya Krishnan 10:52 AM

Thank you for an incredibly informative presentation, Dr. Byars-Winston! In the mentoring literature, do you see more extreme impacts on mentorship in undergraduate research spaces? Specifically, do you see more undergraduate and graduate PEERs (people excluded due to ethnicity or race) leave STEMM spaces due to ineffective mentorship in research than general STEMM academic experiences? On the flip side, do you see PEERs more likely to pursue STEMM from culturally responsive mentorship in research spaces? I ask because mentors (and mentees!) may find teachable moments more accessible in research spaces than in classrooms.

A: I am delighted that you found useful information in my presentation. I do not know of data on the comparative outcomes of undergraduate vs. graduate departure from STEMM by PEER groups. Dr. Kenny Gibbs and his colleagues published on differential career interests and intentions in STEMM by racial/ethnic groups for doctoral and post-doc students (see <https://journals.plos.org/plosone/article/authors?id=10.1371/journal.pone.0114736>). It is an interesting question. One study that you might find interesting found a positive correlation between what the authors called culturally relevant mentoring and undergraduate students’ intentions (not actual behavior) to pursue graduate STEM degrees and careers. See <https://pubmed.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/27543635/> It would be great for someone to study the longitudinal effects of such mentoring on students’ actual STEM persistence.

Tigress McDaniel 10:53 AM

Is there also explicit consideration for discrimination within ethnic groups … i.e. colorism, attractiveness, etc?

A: If you are referring to whether the CAM training explicitly addresses within ethnic group discrimination, the answer is no.

Ramirez, Julio 10:53 AM

I found your observations about ethnocultural empathy interesting. Would I be correct that this approach has practically been required of underrepresented individuals in order to be a member of "mainstream" society?

A: I appreciate your question though I am not aware of data on the implications of this concept for how individuals from UR groups become members of mainstream society. Most participants in the study I reference on ethnocultural empathy racially/ethnically identified as white/European American. Here is the original article on the ethnocultural empathy scale for your reference: <https://www.researchgate.net/publication/232433824_The_Scale_of_Ethnocultural_Empathy_Development_validation_and_reliability>.

Marc Nahmani 10:54 AM

Dr. Byars-Winston, if current evidence points to CAM correlating with positive changes in mentee well-being, is there evidence on effecting mentee STEM outcomes? What factors in the mentoring relationship might have the most profound effect on these outcomes?

A: I do not have any data on correlations between mentor’s CAM participation and their mentees’ well-being. Your questions are intriguing and would require a longitudinal design to capture impact of mentor training on mentee outcomes.

Jose M. Guzman 10:55 AM

Are there opportunties to participate/collaborate/join National Research Mentoring Network? if so, how do they look like?

A: Yes! It is open and free to join the National Research Mentoring Network! Please sign up at: [www.nrmnet.net](http://www.nrmnet.net) and click on Join in the upper right corner.

Anonymous Attendee 10:55 AM

i am sorry i missed the response, Will the resources quoted in this talk be available somewhere?

A: Yes in the slides.

Anonymous Attendee 10:56 AM

For the randomized studies, are different treatments compared or some folks in programs that are not a culturally-responsive curriculum?

A: In our current CAM randomized study, we are only comparing 3 doses (i.e., length of training) of culturally aware mentor training, not comparing against no treatment at all. However, we have results from another randomized study that we are currently submitting for journal review that did compare cultural diversity-focused mentor training intervention against traditional mentor training.

Anonymous Attendee 10:57 AM

What advice might you have for minority faculty who have gotten so exhausted fighting for every career step that they are on the verge of quitting academia to preserve their wellbeing and family dynamic after they have received tenure because they feel antagonized from all sides ?

A: I am empathetic to the treacherous terrain that many faculty from underrepresented racial/ethnic groups walk in academia post promotion. Their experiences and choices are as unique as the individuals themselves. You may find some of the writings by Prof Beronda Montgomery and colleagues provide actionable advice.

Whitaker et al. (2015): <https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC4521729/>

Allen et al., (2021). <https://www.researchgate.net/profile/Itumeleng-Moroenyane/publication/349479882_Growing_a_Community_The_Inaugural_Blackbotanistsweek_Recap_and_Looking_Forward/links/60b750d4299bf106f6f25baf/Growing-a-Community-The-Inaugural-Blackbotanistsweek-Recap-and-Looking-Forward.pdf>

* You may find the book chapter useful written by Montgomery et al. (2020) “I am not your savioress” that is cited in the Allen et al. references.

Alison Crowe 10:59 AM

Thank you so much for this talk. Have you looked at the broader impact of CAM training on other aspects of departmental community e.g. communication in faculty meetings, committee work.

A: Yes, we are. The broader impact of individual CAM training participation on mentors’ department is Aim 2 of our current NIH U01 study. We are examining this individual-to-department impact both quantitatively through a new department climate in STEM measure we created for the study AND qualitatively through a longitudinal (1 year) case study design. As the current NIH CAM NRMN study is currently underway and change takes time to observe., we anticipate having these longitudinal department impact data in 2024.

**Answered live**

(Question written before finishing the seminar, so hopefully is not obvious after the seminar is ended!)

Overall, is it known that the mentorship is more succesful if the mentors and mentees have matched backgrounds, for the purpose of having a succesful mentorship experience for the mentee?

Such as female-female, black-black, LGBTQ-LGBTQ, etc?

This question has been answered live

Merri Casem 10:30 AM

Thank you for this informative presentation.

Can you imagine applying these principles of mentorship to the academic advising relationship? Advising involves less time spent with students, but can be very impactful.

What would be the most important elements to bring to an advising session?

This question has been answered live

Barbara Lom 10:33 AM

How can interested faculty members and/or institutions register for CAM training?

Are there plans to make CAM training more broadly available?

This question has been answered live

Jose M. Guzman 10:39 AM

Brilliant. Thank you very much. What are your thoughts on grad students/postdocs mentoring undergrads?